1986

An Overview of Health Law Research and an Annotated Bibliography

Richard A. Danner

Claire M. Germain
University of Florida Levin College of Law, germain@law.ufl.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://scholarship.law.ufl.edu/facultypub
Part of the Health Law and Policy Commons, and the Legal Writing and Research Commons

Recommended Citation

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty Scholarship at UF Law Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in UF Law Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of UF Law Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact averyle@law.ufl.edu, kaleita@law.ufl.edu.
Notes

1. For a complete description of this endeavor, see M. Kratz, "Introducing Computing Resources to a Faculty of Law," 42 Computers and Law 8 (December 1984).

An Overview of Health Law Research and an Annotated Bibliography

Richard A. Danner and Claire M. Germain, Duke University

The Literature of Health Law

This analysis and the following bibliography are designed to meet the needs of researchers attempting to locate information in the field of health law. The analysis is written from the perspective of law librarians, but the same information retrieval problems apply to health administrators, hospital and medical counsel, and academic lawyers interested in health law and administration.¹

As librarians, we perform two major tasks: collection development (i.e., selecting materials for acquisition and retention in our own libraries) and reference/research (i.e., locating and obtaining information from within our library or from other sources). In health law, both of these tasks are sometimes difficult. There is a growing variety of published information sources for health law, which complicates reference work; the field also has shifting boundaries, which makes it hard to define for collection development purposes. As a result, both law librarians and those in the health field who need health law information are now faced with the problem of having to sift through an expanding number of information sources, without any logical organizational scheme to depend on.

Law librarians, like other librarians serving clients with specialized information needs, find that in interdisciplinary fields the literature is diverse and difficult to control, and information often cannot be obtained from familiar sources. The problems posed by the growth of interdisciplinary approaches to legal scholarship and research have long been of concern to academic law librarians.² These approaches began to have significant effects on legal research and law library collection-building in the 1960s, a period when growing interest in interdisciplinary studies coincided with an expanding literature and growing library budgets. For legal scholars, a notable event during that decade was the establishment of the Law and Society Association in 1964 and the initial publication in 1966 of that association's journal, The Law and Society Review. Other interdisciplinary journals began publication around that time,³ and the application of various techniques and approaches from the social sciences and humanities to the study of law continues to flourish today.

Many thanks are expressed to Janet Sinder, Reference Librarian at the Duke University Law Library, who collaborated on the original bibliography.
Of course, the longstanding interrelationship between law and medicine predates the legal academic's concern with interdisciplinary studies. The traditional relationship between law and medicine, however, is not interdisciplinary in the same sense as the relationships between law and other disciplines. Whereas the new interdisciplinary approaches typically involve the application of techniques and perspectives from another discipline to the study of law or the analysis of legal documents, the traditional literature of law and medicine is far less theoretical. In order to aid lawyers in arguing points of medical proof, utilizing expert medical witnesses, or otherwise preparing medical cases, a large literature of textbooks, handbooks, and encyclopedic works on medical issues relevant to the legal profession has developed over the years. Much of this literature is highly practical. It is also highly marketable; some sources have estimated that up to 80 percent of the average lawyer's cases involve some kind of medical questions. Although these traditional materials relating law and medicine remain within the scope of the health law specialist, they no longer encompass all the topics we now consider to be part of health law, and their effect on the literature is not really interdisciplinary.

Interdisciplinary approaches have their major effects on the processes of legal scholarship; they signal a move in the academic lawyer's research techniques away from strict doctrinal analysis and toward the use of techniques and research materials from other disciplines. For law librarians and others concerned with supplying the information needed for this sort of research, new expertise in selecting materials from non-law disciplines and facility with indexing and searching tools outside those traditionally used in legal research are required.

The growth and complexity of the health law literature is also due to the need for health law attorneys, health care administrators, and other health care professionals to be aware of the effects of federal and state legislation and regulation. Since World War II, if not before, health care has become a major concern of public policy. With the passage of the Public Health Service Act in 1944, the Hill-Burton Amendments in 1946, the Medicaid amendments in 1965, and other legislation, the impact of federal policy decisions on health care has grown enormously. And where policy is made on the state or national level, the importance of legal considerations increases. Policy decisions are shaped to the ways of existing law, and they create new law in their wake. Since the mid-twentieth century, there has been significant federal policy-making on funding for health research, on health-care organization, and on delivery of health-care services, and a corresponding growth in both legislation and regulation in each of these areas. This growth has created a need for continuing information regarding the factors going into policy-making, and on the impact of policies already in place.

Some policy areas affect health law directly through enacted legislation and regulation. Policy questions also are involved in newly developing areas of concern, such as ethical issues in treatment, bioethics, genetics and human reproduction, and transplantation—whether or not society's concerns have yet been
expressed in legislation. The growing importance of health policy considerations to medical and health counsel, other specialists in medical law, and health care administrators has been a major factor in the mushrooming of what we now call health law.

This change to a greater concern with the making of policy decisions and their impact is seen in the changing foci of the standard texts in hospital law and health care law. The early treatments, beginning with Lapp and Ketcham's 1926 text *Hospital Law* and extending through Emanuel and Lillian Hayt's series of texts in the 1940s, deal with subjects such as the differences in immunity and liability among charitable, public, and private hospitals; the evidentiary value of medical records; the hospital's property rights and corporate status; and organization of the hospital staff. The modern texts, as David Warren pointed out in a recent comparative review, are much more diverse in their coverage. The works he reviewed include several texts aimed at health administrators, and three law school case books. The case books consist largely of excerpted cases, statutes, and other materials, compiled for use as teaching materials in law school courses in law and medicine. Indeed the titles of two of the books reviewed are *Cases and Materials on Law and Medicine*; the third is entitled *Law, Medicine and Forensic Science*. His review of the coverage of these case books is helpful in showing the changing concerns of the lawyer interested in law and medicine or in health law.

The contemporary works, despite their continued emphasis on and coverage of the conventional medical legal topics—forensic science, medical proof in litigation, medical and hospital liability—also (to varying degrees) cover the broader concerns of health law and policy expressed in government regulation of health care, and the newer areas of policy concern mentioned above. From examining these texts, one gets a sense of the amorphous nature of the field. The same feeling results from an examination of the coverage of the newsletters and journals identified in our own bibliography. Some current periodicals specialize in the traditional concerns of law and medicine, others in specific areas of contemporary concern, and still others in news of government actions and proposals for action; and many provide various combinations of these approaches. The literature of the field is made complex by the variety of its topics, the dispersed sources for the information, and the changing nature of the topics it encompasses.

Another reason why the literature of health law is difficult to work with is the variety of audiences at which it is aimed and marketed. In law generally, librarians have a choice among books and journals aimed directly at the law school market—scholarly monographs and reviews or student treatises keyed to the law school curriculum, and more practical works aimed at simplifying the work of the practicing attorney. In health law, selection decisions are more complicated, because the standard texts have been written not for the lawyer at all, but for the health administrator. The case books, by their nature, do not provide the expository treatment of the field that a treatise does; and there are as yet no book-
length treatises or texts designed for the health lawyer, as there are in other areas of law. Perhaps this is because health law is an interdisciplinary field, or because it is a field characterized by the impact of policy considerations; in a field with shifting boundaries, the writing of a standard work may be slow in coming. There does seem to be an increasing concern with legal scholarship in health law, however, as signaled by the starting of two new law-school-based journals in health law. 14

The literature of texts in health law aimed at health administrators extends from the early treatises in hospital law by the Hayts and others to several recent textbooks. 15 These books all to some extent explain basic principles and institutions of law to their non-lawyer audience, and show how legal principles apply to health law problems. They do not provide, however, the level of analysis and the detailed references to primary sources of the typical treatise written for the lawyer. 16

The monographic literature of health law is similarly difficult for a law librarian to evaluate, because none of it is totally satisfactory for the professional audience. Little of it is aimed at the academic lawyer or even at the practicing attorney specializing in the area. And while the periodical and current-awareness literature of the field, on the other hand, is aimed at the specialist attorney as well as at the health care professional, there is so much of it, and it is so extremely specialized in coverage and audience, that selection and evaluation decisions are difficult.

The following bibliography provides a perspective on the wealth of information available in that segment of the literature, and on the current resources for organizing and indexing it. The bibliography also illustrates the problems of obtaining information in the field of health law, at the same time that it provides a guide to that information. No bibliography of health law materials can solve the problems we have discussed here: that the field itself is without formal definition, encompassing traditional areas of concern in law and medicine, and in hospital law, as well as new concerns raised by policy considerations in the health care field; that health law lacks the grounding provided by standard legal texts and journals; and that the periodical literature of the field is highly specialized and fragmented, is issued from a number of sources, and is aimed in large part at segments of a broader audience with health law concerns but without legal expertise. In brief, the literature of health law is a literature in need of control, so that information can be located efficiently and effectively. The bibliography we provide is meant as a first step in that direction.

Using the Bibliography as a First Step

Our bibliography explores the variety of information sources which may be of use to the health law researcher. It more specifically focuses on the important
question of access to the materials. The fragmentation of resources and the inter-disciplinary nature of the field mandate that the researcher use a multiplicity of indexes to get access to the materials needed. The bibliography describes the various indexes available, and the publications indexed by each. The information sources are available in printed form, as well as in computerized formats, but online searching is stressed here.

The bibliography is divided into two main parts: "General Materials" and "Specialized Materials." It is important to understand that the easiest way to get access to the wide range of articles is to use some of the major general indexes to the periodical literature of law, medicine, or health sciences. This is because health law touches upon areas that are not comprehensively covered in the more specialized materials. In addition to subjects classically associated with health law—such as hospital law, medical malpractice, and bioethics—the field currently extends to several other branches of law, including antitrust law and business associations (hospital mergers, corporate practice of medicine, HMOs), contracts and torts, patent law, environmental law, and even federal election law (for example, in the context of PACs acting on behalf of the American Hospital Association). Another often overlooked source of information is the bulk of materials published by the government. The list of specialized materials is representative, rather than exhaustive. It takes into consideration the publications of the most important professional associations and interest groups associated with health law. The publisher's information included with each entry should give the reader an idea of the audience contemplated by the publication.

An intelligent research strategy will depend on the research needs to be met. A specialized newsletter might adequately fill the needs of a practicing attorney to keep abreast of current developments. For in-depth research, a computerized literature search through the major periodical indexes will be recommended. Health law researchers would be well-advised to seek the professional services which can be found in medical and law libraries, as well as U.S. depository libraries. Most reference law librarians are law-trained, as well as library-educated. Medical librarians have a strong and well-established tradition of performing computerized literature searches for their patrons. The best place to find government documents is to go to the nearest U.S. government depository library—there is usually at least one at every university. The main problem with federal documents is that the materials are usually not represented in the main card catalog of the institution. Federal documents librarians, however, have expertise and knowledge of appropriate special indexes and how to use them.

In all these libraries, the staff can be helpful in identifying publications, providing publishers' addresses, explaining the library's resources and services, and, if need be, performing computerized literature searches.

Two specialized libraries offer services to their members. The Sagall Library of Law, Medicine and Health Care serves as an information clearinghouse for members of the American Society of Law and Medicine. It is located, together
with the executive offices of the Society, in the Law Tower Building of Boston University. Members of the Society may borrow books, use the photocopy services, and get research assistance from the Library. For more information, write to American Society of Law and Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Mass. 02215.

In a similar way, the American Hospital Association sponsors a Resource Center which uses the facilities of the Asa S. Bacon Memorial Library and uses the computerized Health Planning and Administration Database. It provides services to health care specialists. Some are free of charge and others are offered on a fee-for-service basis to both members and nonmembers. Services include factual information, research assistance, and a document delivery service. For more information, write to American Hospital Association Resource Center, 840 Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, Ill. 60611; (312) 280-6263.

Notes


9. John A. Lapp and Dorothy Ketcham, Hospital Law (Milwaukee: Bruce, 1926).


15. Among the current texts are: Tom Christoffel, Health and the Law (New York: The Free Press, 1982); George D. Pozgar, Legal Aspects of Health Care Administration (Germantown, Md.:
152 Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law


16. Perhaps the closest approximation in health to the standard legal treatise in other fields is Aspen Systems Corporation, Hospital Law Manual, 6 vols. (Rockville, Md.: Aspen, 1983 on). The set has three volumes written for the health administrator and three for attorneys. Neither part goes far beyond the traditional concerns of hospital law.

I. General Materials

Indexes to Periodical Literature

Indexes to Legal Periodicals

Current Law Index or Legal Resource Index (microfilm). Belmont, Calif.: Information Access Corporation, 1980 on. Monthly, with cumulations. This is the best and most comprehensive source for current information. Over 700 English-language law periodicals are indexed, including the U.S., British, Canadian, Australian, and New Zealand legal literature and several U.S. legal newspapers, such as American Lawyer, Legal Times, and National Law Journal. It is limited to periodicals, however, and does not cover digests and specialized newsletters. It is available in paper format and cumulative microfilm. A new version is Legal Trac, the database being stored on a videodisc and access provided through an IBM-PC. The Index can also be searched online. Index to Legal Periodicals. Bronx, N.Y.: Wilson Co., 1908 on. Quarterly, with annual cumulations. Forerunner to CLI/LRI. Also searchable online via "Wilsonline."

Index to Foreign Legal Periodicals. Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press, 1960 on. Quarterly, with cumulations. Provides access to the world legal periodical literature, mainly in languages other than English.


Indexes to Medical and Health Sciences Periodicals

Hospital Literature Index. Chicago, Ill.: American Hospital Association, 1945 on. Quarterly, with annual cumulations. Indexes the English-language literature dealing with the nonclinical aspects of health care delivery, including health insurance, HMOs, and financial and personnel management. Cooperatively produced with the National Library of
Medicine and currently derived from the *Health Planning and Administration* online database.


Comprehensive index to every area in the broad field of biomedicine. Covers approximately 2600 periodicals in all languages. Derived from MEDLINE online database which also corresponds to the printed indexes, *Index to Dental Literature* and *International Nursing Index*.

**General Indexes**

A variety of interdisciplinary indexes, such as *Public Affairs Information Service* and the *New York Times Index*, may be of use to the health law researcher for articles written in periodicals, magazines, and newspapers outside of the medico-legal field. Most are searchable online.

**Access to Government Information**

**Statistical**

The following two major commercial indexes stand out because of their comprehensiveness. Both are searchable online.


Indexes and abstracts over 500 sources within the federal government (e.g., statistics from the National Center for Health Statistics).


Indexes and abstracts sources from U.S. private organizations, such as the American Medical Association, and state government agencies.

**Congressional**


Indexes and abstracts all congressional publications, including hearings, reports, prints, and documents. Also searchable online.

**General**


General index to all U.S. documents distributed by the Government Printing Office. Can also be searched online.
154 Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law

MEDOC. Salt Lake City, Utah: University of Utah Health Sciences Library, 1975 on. Quarterly, with annual cumulations.

Index to U.S. government publications in the medical and health sciences.

CIS Federal Register Index. Bethesda, Md.: Congressional Information Service. Most comprehensive index to the Federal Register, which contains rules and regulations of the federal executive and administrative agencies, as well as proposed rules and notices. Rules and regulations having a general applicability are at the end of the year codified into the Code of Federal Regulations. Both the Federal Register and the Code of Federal Regulations can be searched online.

Government Reports Announcements and Index. Springfield, Va.: National Technical Information Service. Biweekly. This is the main index to National Technical Information Service documents. It provides access to research, reports, and studies produced under federal grants and contracts. Numerous health law topics can also be found.

LEXIS and WESTLAW

LEXIS and WESTLAW are the two major full-text computerized legal retrieval systems. They both consist of various libraries containing cases, administrative decisions, attorney general opinions, regulatory and other materials, now including law reviews.

WESTLAW does not contain any specific health law database. Their Office of Research and Development does not have any plans for a specialized database. Specific West Digest topics, such as "Social Security" and "Health Law and Environment," can be used to narrow down a search.

LEXIS also does not have a specific health law database. However, other services are available in addition to LEXIS, such as NEXIS and MEDIS. NEXIS contains the full text of over 100 publications, including newspapers, magazines, wire services, newsletters, and reference materials. It is especially useful for information on new products and drugs, pending lawsuits, trends, and statistics. MEDIS is a new service and consists of over 50 clinical medical publications, journals, newsletters, and textbooks, comprising the full range of medical practice. The health law researcher might use it to determine standards of care, identify potential expert witnesses, gain background information on a medical topic, and generally to monitor trends in health care.

II. Specialized Materials

The variety of publications can be broken down into the following categories: major periodicals, digests of primary sources (legislation, regulations, and case
law), and newsletters. These come from many sources, including the academic community, professional associations, and interest groups, as well as the government. The list is representative. To it could be added the numerous newsletters of the Health Law Sections of the State Bar Associations—e.g., the Health Law News, published by the Virginia State Bar. Newsletters are also issued by local hospital associations, as well as local or state groups—such as the California Health Law News, published quarterly by the California Society of Health Care Attorneys. Only a few private law firm newsletters are mentioned here.

Major Periodicals


Health Law in Canada. Scarborough, Ont.: Butterworth, 1980 on. Quarterly. $45. Indexed in CLI, Hospital Literature Index and Index to Canadian Periodical Literature.

Published for the Canadian Institute of Law and Medicine.


Journal of Legal Medicine. Long Island City, N.Y.: American College of Legal Medicine, 1979 on. Quarterly. $56. Indexed in CLI, ILP, Hospital Literature Index, and Index Medicus/MEDLINE.


Law, Medicine and Health Care. Boston, Mass.: American Society of Law and Medicine, 1973 on. 6 times a year. $40. Indexed in CLI, HEALTHLAWYER, and Hospital Literature Index.


Legal Medical Quarterly. Toronto, Ont.: Legal Medical Quarterly, 1977 on. Quarterly. $40. Indexed in CLI.

Medical Trial Technique Quarterly. Wilmette, Ill.: Callaghan, 1980 on. Quarterly. $73.50. Indexed in CLI.

156 Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law

Digests

Subject reporter containing cases, articles, and legislation concerning ethical and legal issues in medicine, health care administration, and human experimentation.

The Citation: A Medicolegal Digest for Physicians. Chicago, Ill.: American Medical Association. Twice monthly. $40.
Contains case briefs in all areas of medicine.

Focuses on North Carolina law (legislation and cases) relating to public health, mental health, medicine, and hospitals, as well as medical-legal investigations and medical jurisprudence.

Contains annotations of cases related to health care. Arranged by subject, such as antitrust, constitutional law, medical records, and health planning. Heavily relied upon by health care lawyers.

Discusses recent court decisions affecting hospitals.

Covers health laws, regulations, and studies in comparative health legislation.

Published for the medical liability insurance policy holders.

Summarizes and analyzes recent decisions of national significance for the health care law practice, thoroughly indexed. Continues in part Professional Liability Reporter.

Contains cases, statutes, and materials on law and life sciences.

Includes case annotations, bibliographies, and commentaries, usually a reprint of a law review article.
Newsletters

*Action Kit for Hospital Law.* Pittsburgh, Pa.: Hory, Springer & Mattern.
  Law firm newsletter.

*Biomedical Safety and Standards Newsletter.* Brea, Calif.: Quest, 1971 on. Twice a month. $98.
  Written for the fields of medical safety and standards. Includes factual reports on safety hazards and product recalls, standards, legal actions, legislation and regulations, hospital safety, education, and meetings.

  Free to hospitals and school libraries; others $5.
  Contains articles on subjects such as living wills and the right to refuse life support.

*Developments in Mental Health Law.* Charlottesville, Va.: Institute of Law, Psychiatry and Public Policy at the University of Virginia. Quarterly. Free.
  Analyzes current national and state (primarily Virginia) developments in the legislature and courts.

  This newsletter was "created to respond to the particular needs of professionals involved with faculty practice plans and related legal matters."


*Health Care Briefing.* Los Angeles, Calif.: Arthur Young, 1977 on.

*Health Law Bulletin.* See above under "Digests."

  Law firm newsletter.

  Law firm newsletter.

*Health Law Vigil.* Chicago, Ill.: American Hospital Association, Office of Legal and Regulatory Affairs, 1980 on. Every two weeks. $150, members; $200, nonmembers. Indexed in HEALTHLAWYER, Hospital Literature Index, and MEDLINE.
  Analyzes judicial, legislative, and regulatory developments affecting hospitals.

*The Health Lawyer.* Chicago, Ill.: American Bar Association, Forum Committee on Health Law, 1984 on. 3–4 times a year. Free to members.
  Contains substantive articles and committee news.

  Reports on mainly legislative and administrative developments in the health care field.

*HealthSpan.* Clifton, N.J.: Law and Business Inc., 1985 on. 10 times a year. $95.
Covers several health-related areas (e.g., bioethics, reimbursements, professional issues). Continues HealthScan.

Reports on health policy and cost containment, including legislation and court decisions.

Henry P. Kaplan Newsletter. 20745 Sevilla Lane, Saratoga, Calif. 95070.
Law firm newsletter.

Reviews congressional action regarding health matters that affects NIH.

Hospital Ethics. Chicago, Ill.: American Hospital Association, 1985 on. Bimonthly. $60 for members, $80 for nonmembers. Indexed in HEALTHLAWYER.
Contains news on human experimentation, care of the dying and newborn, behavioral ethics, and other aspects of hospital ethics.


Reviews recent legal developments. Also contains substantive articles.

Covers national and local health-care-related developments of interest to hospital administrators. Includes cases and legislation.

Discusses vaccines, infectious diseases, and related topics.

Digest of articles from leading medical journals of interest to attorneys handling medical-related cases.

Each issue contains two or three articles, a question-and-answer column, and book reviews.


State litigation in Medicaid fraud.

Medical Benefits. Charlottesville, Va.: Kelly Communications, 1984 on. Every 2 weeks. $112.
A medical-economics digest. Includes excerpts from newspapers and magazines.


In-depth coverage of medical devices—regulatory agency and congressional news, industry news, etc.


Covers litigation, case law, government regulation, and insurance trends in medical malpractice.


Formerly *Malpractice Lifeline*. Deals exclusively with the problems and trends of medical professional liability.


Medical articles by physicians, dentists, and nurses; includes strategies for cases, legislative and judicial developments.


A malpractice jury verdict reporter.


Highlights activities and services of the insurance company.


Briefs hospital physicians and administrators on issues such as professional liability, joint-venturing hospitals, and legal aspects of organ requests for transplantation.


Covers legislative developments and HHS news dealing with Medicare and Medicaid.

*Medico-Legal Bulletin.* Richmond, Va.: Virginia State Health Department, Office of the Chief Medical Examiner and Medical College of Virginia, Department of Legal Medicine, 1951 on. Bimonthly. Free to qualified personnel. Indexed in *Index Medicus, Excerpta Medica*.

Contains articles of interest to health and health law practitioners.


Columns in this newsletter include the President's Corner, job vacancies, and NHLA member developments.
Mental and Physical Disability Law Reporter. Washington, D.C.: American Bar Association, Committee on Mentally Disabled, 1976 on. 6 times a year. $135, institutions; $90, individuals. Indexed in CLI. Covers all aspects of law for the handicapped—case law, administrative actions, legislation, bibliographies, etc.

NCHSR Program Note. Rockville, Md.: National Center for Health Services Research and Health Care Technology Assessment.


Computerized Indexing/Abstracting Services

Bibliographic database devoted to recent developments in health law. Contains case digests, full text of articles from selected newsletters, and abstracts from articles in law reviews, journals, and conference proceedings.

Health Law Project. University of Alberta, Edmonton, Canada. Supported by a grant from the Alberta Foundation.

Contains Canadian, English, and Commonwealth cases dealing with health law issues, as well as articles from major Canadian and American medical-legal journals and other materials.